



Twin Falls Historic Preservation Commission Minutes

Monday, February 6, 2023, 3:00 PM

203 Main Avenue East
Twin Falls, ID 83301

COUNCIL CHAMBERS

Members: Doug Baughman Chairperson, Jennifer Shaffer Vice Chairperson, Ben Woodbury, Lisa Buddecke, Terry McCurdy, Aarianna Harmon, Cherie Vollmer

Council Liaison: Spencer Cutler

1) Confirmation of Quorum/Call Meeting to Order

Commissioner Woodbury called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm
A quorum was present.

Members Present: *Buddecke, Woodbury, McCurdy, Harmon*

Liaison: *Cutler*

Staff Present: *Strickland, Ebersole*

2) Consent Calendar

MOTION: Commissioner McCurdy moved to approve the Consent Calendar, as presented.
Commissioner Harmon seconded the motion.

Unanimously Approved by a vote of 4 to 0.

- a) Approval of minutes from the following meeting: January 23, 2023

3) Certificate of Appropriateness

- a) Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for roof repair, window replacement a minor addition to property located at 125 Main Avenue East c/o Kahler Nield on behalf of Glanbia. (PZ23-0005)

Staff Presentation:

City Planner Strickland presented the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for roof repair, window replacement a minor addition to property located at 125 Main Avenue East c/o Kahler Nield on behalf of Glanbia. (PZ23-0005)

The Certificate of Appropriateness process requires a public meeting in which interested persons can be heard, with regards to the application. The historic preservation commission shall review the "design guidelines" as they exist or as amended for compliance before issuing a certificate of appropriateness. The Commission may approve or deny the request. Any conditions placed by Commission shall be specifically listed on the Certificate and shall be completed as part of the approval. Any decision of the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. The building was constructed circa 1907 and is a contributing building.

TWIN FALLS DOWNTOWN DISTRICT

2.1.5 GENERAL GUIDELINES: TWIN FALLS DOWNTOWN DISTRICT

IT IS GENERALLY APPROPRIATE TO:

- Repair and restore buildings before considering replacing them, highlighting key details.
- Maintain the prevalent historic and architectural styles of the district.
- When adding to an historic building, maintain the prevalent historic and architectural qualities of the district by restoring the historic building and keeping the additions in scale and compatible.
- Set the street facades with a zero setback to maintain a continuous 'street wall' consistent with historic properties on the block.
- Cultural and civic structures are allowed to have 'pride of place' with setbacks and form differences, while maintaining compatible human scale elements at street level.
- Step back new story additions above the prevalent parapet line of existing and/or adjacent historic structures.
- Maintain a visual horizontal break element on the facade between the first and second floors.
- Create ornament and detail for new buildings and additions that are compatible with the existing building. Details should be compatible in providing substantial 'depth' with materials and finishes found traditionally on the building or in the district.
- When installing new sidewalks or plazas, maintain compatibility with the character of the streetscape.
- Preserve existing historic outbuildings and significant landscape features including accessible paths and ramps.
- Locate parking spaces to the rear of the property and/or screened from streets.
- Preserve the character of the building in adapting it to meet the requirements of the Americans for Disabilities Act.
- Comply with guidelines for new construction, additions, and methods for construction, maintenance, and repair in the following chapters.

IT IS GENERALLY NOT APPROPRIATE TO:

- Demolish viable historic structures.
- Remove existing buildings for surface parking.
- Use incongruous materials such as un-faced concrete, plastic, vinyl, fiberglass, concrete block (CMU), glass block, stucco, EIFS, and corrugated or other metal siding as the dominant building material on additions and
- new buildings, unless proven as original materials.
- Locate parking in front of the building on the property unless proven
- historically located.
- Conflict with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation as state in Chapter 1.2.

8.1 Appropriate Methods for Window Replacement

Windows in Twin Falls' Historic districts offer visual interest within a variety of architectural styles. A window is a glazed opening in the wall of a building that was historically used to admit light and air. It is commonly fitted within a frame that supports one or more operable or fixed sash units containing panes of glass. The functional and decorative features of the windows

that help define the building's historic character should be identified, retained and preserved. These elements may include frames, sills, heads, sash, glazing, muntins, hoodmolds, lintels, transoms and decorated jambs and moldings. If elements have deteriorated beyond the point of salvage, they can be repaired. If the element is deteriorated beyond repair, it can be replaced.

IT IS GENERALLY APPROPRIATE TO:

- Preserve and repair the window elements, rather than replacing them.
- Replace window or window elements, if absolutely necessary duplicating the existing material, design, configuration and hardware. These windows should have true-divided lights with the style and size of the muntins to match the original windows.
- Install or replace damaged weather stripping and caulking and/or install storm windows instead of replacing original glass with double-glazing for thermal upgrades. Match the mullions, muntins, meeting rails, size and configuration of the storm to the primary window. Paint to match the building's trim color in 'house form' buildings. Paint to match the window in 'block form' buildings.

IT IS GENERALLY NOT APPROPRIATE TO:

- Cover over or infill window openings with materials other than similar to the original. Glass block (where it did not exist), plywood and other materials are not allowed.
- Replace multi-sashed or a multi-light sash windows with a single span of glass.
- Install false muntins that only exist on the outside of glazing. For non-character-defining elevations, the Historic Preservation Commission will review window replacements on a case by case basis.
- Use mirrored or tinted glass.
- Avoid recreating missing elements unless strong pictorial, historical or physical documentation exists.
- Use stained or leaded glass only if it was originally on the building.
- Use vinyl or other non-historic materials.

8.2 Appropriate Methods for Replacement of Historic Elements

Historic elements addressed in this section include roofs, parapets, cornices, storefronts, entrances and doors. Methods to repair and replace materials such as masonry, wood and metal are also included, whereas methods for paint removal and window replacement are discussed in Sections 8.1 and 8.4.

8.2.1 Roofs

Roof forms are unique character-defining elements in terms of building style and period and should be retained and preserved, not altered or obscured.

IT IS GENERALLY APPROPRIATE TO:

- Replace the existing roof materials with the same materials as the original, or a compatible substitute material if roof replacement becomes necessary. The replacement roof should match the original composition, size, shape, color, decorative patterning and texture of the original.
- Preserve decorative features such as cupolas, cresting, dormers, chimneys and weather vanes and their shapes, materials, size, color and patterning. When

replacement of these features becomes necessary, the replacement feature should match the original in terms of design and materials.

- Install new additions such as skylights, antennas or mechanical equipment in such a manner as to not be visible from the pedestrian view.
- Locate new dormers on rear and side facing slopes of the roof and not visible from the public way.

IT IS GENERALLY NOT APPROPRIATE TO:

- Build alterations or changes that radically change, damage or destroy the roof's defining historic characteristics.
- Add bubble, faceted or dome skylights, particularly on the character-defining elevations, unless screened from view. On non-character defining elevations, flat, sloped glazing skylights may be approved on a case-by-case basis.

4.2 Minor Additions

POLICY

Allow and encourage minor building additions and improvements while preserving the historical character, proportion, and rhythm of existing buildings within the district.

IT IS GENERALLY APPROPRIATE TO:

- Locate minor additions in minimally invasive locations and areas that do not impair the character-defining aspects of the historic structure.
- Create additions that respond and are compatible with the historic aspects of the original building.
- Contribute to the character of the original building by respecting the scale, massing, form, proportion, rhythm, materials, and details of existing historic buildings.
- Attach new fixtures in a manner that preserves and does not harm historic elements.

IT IS GENERALLY NOT APPROPRIATE TO:

- Create minor additions with incompatible materials.
- Create minor additions that harm historic elements of the original building.
- Locate minor additions so as to detract from the overall character of an historic building.

This is a request for a roof replacement, window replacement and a minor addition of a patio area to the rear of the property located at 125 Main Ave E. The roof replacement is an in-kind replacement to repair the existing roof that is damaged. There will not be any design changes to the roof line. The window is located on the rear wall of the building and it is proposed to replace the windows and add a minor addition to create a patio area for the residential units that will be located on the upper floor of the building. This patio area will not only provide a seating area for the residential units but will provide an additional exit route for the residential building to meet life safety requirements. It will be located in a minimally invasive location and will be tucked in between the adjacent buildings.

Sections 2.1 General Downtown Guidelines and Section 8.1 and 8.2 Repair and Replacement Methods 4.2 Minor Additions. As the commission, your review is based on the guidelines, the type of request and if the proposed changes are compatible with the character of the district and are generally in conformance with the Downtown Design Guidelines. Section

8.4 Appropriate Methods for Removing Paint this section is addressed in the applicant's narrative. However, they will be painting over the existing paint, not removing what is existing. Therefore, the maintenance is very important and reapplication is recommended every 5-8 years.

Staff has reviewed the request and does not anticipate any negative impacts related to the request and would recommend the following conditions if approved.

1. Subject to site plan amendments as required by the city codes and standards.
2. Subject to the applicant obtaining the appropriate permits as required.

Applicant Presentation:

Kahler Nield, applicant, presented the request for a for a Certificate of Appropriateness for roof repair, window replacement a minor addition to property located at 125 Main Avenue East. He stated the owner of the building wants to preserve and improve usability of the second floor. He stated they will replace the current roof with new wood trusses, with nothing visible from ground level. He stated they would like to add an outdoor patio as an amenity to the three residential units. He stated there will be no change to the stairs. He stated there will be no additional doors on the second floor. The windows will be replaced with white vinyl windows, and the paint will be a neutral gray. The applicant will go through the building permit process for the renovation, meeting building code and setback requirements.

HPC Questions & Comments:

- Commissioner Woodbury asked if there is an alleyway behind the building.
- City Planner Strickland stated, yes, it is an alleyway attached to the parking lot at Shoshone Street and 2nd Avenue.
- Commissioner McCurdy asked about the lot being a public or private parking lot.
- City Planner Strickland stated there are sections of both type of parking.
- Commissioner Buddecke asked about the brick being repainted.
- City Planner Strickland stated the applicant is painting it gray.
- Commissioner Woodbury asked about if there will be a change to the roof line or just repair work.
- City Planner Strickland explained the applicant is only repairing the roof.

MOTION: Commissioner McCurdy moved to approve the request for roof repair, window replacement a minor addition to property located at 125 Main Avenue East c/o Kahler Nield on behalf of Glanbia, as presented, with staff recommendations. (PZ23-0005)
Commissioner Harmon seconded the motion.

Unanimously Approved by a vote of 4 to 0.

4) Old Business

5) New Business

Grant season – email any ideas to City Planner Strickland to discuss at future meetings.
Last year's grant applications were not chosen.

Action Item: New Brochure – set up meeting for City Planner Strickland and Commissioner Buddecke.

Liaison Cutler stated he can share with Council any grant application plans.

6) Upcoming Meeting(s)

a) Monday, March 6, 2023

7) Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 03:22 PM

Kelli Ebersole

Kelli Ebersole, Technician